

A Best Evidence in Medical Education systematic review to determine the most effective teaching methods that develop reflection in medical students: BEME guide No. 51

AUTHOR(S)

Jane Uygun, Ellen Stuart, Muireann De Paor, Emma Wallace, Seamus Duffy, Maire O'Shea, Susan Smith, Teresa Pawlikowska

CITATION

Uygun, Jane; Stuart, Ellen; De Paor, Muireann; Wallace, Emma; Duffy, Seamus; O'Shea, Maire; et al. (2020): A Best Evidence in Medical Education systematic review to determine the most effective teaching methods that develop reflection in medical students: BEME guide No. 51. Royal College of Surgeons in Ireland. Journal contribution. <https://hdl.handle.net/10779/rcsi.12886976.v1>

HANDLE

[10779/rcsi.12886976.v1](https://hdl.handle.net/10779/rcsi.12886976.v1)

LICENCE

CC BY-NC-SA 4.0

This work is made available under the above open licence by RCSI and has been printed from <https://repository.rcsi.com>. For more information please contact repository@rcsi.com

URL

https://repository.rcsi.com/articles/journal_contribution/A_Best_Evidence_in_Medical_Education_systematic_review_to_determine_the_most_effective_teaching_methods_that_develop_reflection_in_medical_students_BEME_guide_No_51/12886976/1

Table 3 – Qualitative studies – all studies use a descriptive qualitative design with either thematic or content analysis						
Author/ Year	Context	Intervention	Outcomes	Risk of bias/Strength of findings/ Overall rating	Kirkpatrick	Main Findings re: teaching reflection
Carr and Carmody 2006	Australia Obs/Gyne Clerkship	Small-group, writing reflective summaries, 1:1 discussion of reflections with staff	Thematic content analysis of student reflections to identify levels of critical reflection and explore emergent themes	8/10 3/5 Good	2a	Evaluating reflective level may help students develop reflection. 4 levels include: listing, describing, applying and integrating
Chou et al 2011	USA Medicine Clerkship Community Option	Weekly one hour facilitated group sessions to create supportive learning	Thematic analysis of post surveys and focus groups to understand students' perceptions of peer group support and satisfaction	8/10 2/5 Acceptable	1	Students appreciate peer support and valued experience
Chretien et al 2008	USA Medicine Clerkship	Class web blog, reflective postings, instructor and peer feedback	Thematic analysis of blog and student feedback to see if intervention promoting reflection on professional development	8/10 3/5 Good	2a	Structured, theory driven faculty-facilitation blogs can promote reflection, uncover hidden curriculum & support professional development
Lutz et al 2013	Germany Integrative medicine Clerkship	Facilitated small group CRT using professional dilemmas	Content analysis of semi-structured interviews conducted post CRT to evaluate students' perceptions of CRT	10/10 3/5 Acceptable	2a	CRT may decrease stress and improve patient care and professional development
Lutz 2016	Germany Integrative medicine Clerkship	Facilitated small group CRT using professional dilemmas	Secondary thematic content analysis of semi-structured interviews to identify how reflective practice can enhance communication	10/10 3/5 Acceptable	2a	Reflecting on current & real challenges, in a group format with a trainer may foster competency in handling difficult clinical communication situations creatively
Makoul 2010	USA Communication skills Clerkship	Difficult conversations topic, anonymous online forum, templates for posts, faculty feedback	Content analysis of online posts to see if forum gives students opportunity to reflect	8/10 2/5 Acceptable	2a	Structured approach for reflection and a simple safe mechanism for feedback are essential for learning regarding difficult conversations
Naeger 2015	USA Radiology elective Clerkship	Reflective journal after previous instruction in other courses on reflection	Thematic analysis of journals to see if reflective writing can improve interprofessional collaboration	9/10 2/5 Acceptable	2a	Reflective writing allows students to explore their role and responsibilities and may improve inter-professional teamwork
O'Neill et al 2016	Australia Pilot Clerkship	Balint Group	Description of pre and post survey answers. Thematic analysis of students essays and leader's observations to evaluate this pilot	9/10 2/5 Acceptable	2a	Balint method: 1) requires modification to level of training, and 2) increased awareness of patient-doctor dynamics and how doctor's psychological factors impact it.
Ozcarar et al 2009	Turkey Clinical skills Early clinical	Portfolio with guidelines	Content analysis of portfolios to evaluate intervention	8/10 2/5 Acceptable	1	Portfolio useful for exploring practice evaluation, patient perspective & primary prevention/health promotion. Students felt portfolio was valuable.
Plack et al 2010	USA Paediatrics Clerkship	30min presentation, discussion of critical incident in small groups on electronic discussion board, summative reflective essay	Thematic analysis of critical incidents, discussion threads and summative reflective essays to determine student engagement and identify challenges they are having in clerkship	10/10 2/5 Acceptable	2a	Students engaged in reflection on complex clinical issues. Reflections exposed "hidden curriculum" issues and offered the insights that could improve clerkship experiences.
Salminen et al 2014	Sweden Primary care Clerkship	Virtual patient pilot	Content analysis of semi-structured focus group interviews to gather student's opinions about the pilot	7/10 2/5 Acceptable	2a	There was good acceptance of the model by students. The VP case supported their self-directed learning and reflective ability.
Saunders et al 2007	USA CAM elective Preclinical	Mind-body skills, faculty led small groups	Self-report questionnaire with six open ended questions analysed using NVivo in order to understand impact of the course on students	7/10 3/5 Acceptable	2a	Students described connection, self-discovery, stress relief and learning through intervention. May enable self-awareness, reflection and self-care

Abbreviations: CAM – Complementary and Alternative Medicine; CRT – Critical Reflection Training; Obs/Gyne – Obstetrics and Gynaecology; USA – United States of America